



## FAMILY LAW

### Cases and Materials

#### Volume III

Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto

1996-1997

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair, Ella Schwartz, Faith Teo and Wendy Adams

\* \* \*

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use  
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*

A7 / Q544

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP 4 1996

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume III

Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto

1996-1997

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair, Ella Schwartz, Faith Teo and Wendy Adams

\* \* \*

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use  
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

[https://archive.org/details/familylawcasesma03roge\\_5](https://archive.org/details/familylawcasesma03roge_5)

# FAMILY LAW

1996-1997

Professors Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer

## Table of Contents

### Volume III

	<u>Page No.</u>
<b>VIII. DOMESTIC CONTRACTS</b>	
<b>A. <u>Introduction: Contracting in the Family Context</u></b>	
<i>Balfour v. Balfour</i> .....	653
<i>Harper's Magazine, "Conditional Love"</i> .....	653
O'Donovan, "Reforming the Private" from <i>Sexual Divisions in Law</i> .....	655
Mnookin, "Divorce Bargaining: the Limits on Private Ordering" .....	658
Trebilcock and Keshvani, "The Role of Private Ordering in Family Law" .....	662
Bailey, " <i>Pelch, Caron, and Richardson</i> " .....	664
Note: The <i>Pelech</i> Trilogy.....	664
<b>B. <u>Limits on Contracting</u></b>	
a) <b><u>Setting Aside Contracts: General Principles of Contract Law</u></b>	
<i>Hovius, Family Law</i> .....	666
<i>Hyldtoft v. Hyldtoft</i> .....	667
<i>Puopolo v. Puopolo</i> .....	668
<i>Lindsay v. Lindsay</i> .....	671
<i>Crouse v. Crouse</i> .....	676
Note: <i>Heaton v. Heaton; Currie v. Currie</i> .....	680
<i>Rosen v. Rosen</i> .....	681
<i>Slate v. Slate</i> .....	684
Majury, "Unconscionability in an Equality Context" .....	685
b) <b><u>Statutory Powers to Set Aside and Vary</u></b>	
Introductory Note .....	691

i)	<u>Post-Pelech: Variation Requests by Wives (Payees)</u>	
	Cossman, "A Matter of Difference: Domestic Contracts and Gender Equality".....	691
	Note: <i>Fyffe; Marshall; Isaacson</i> .....	693
	<i>Winsor v. Winsor</i> .....	694
ii)	<u>Post-Pelech: Variation Requests by Husbands (Payors)</u>	
	Bailey, " <i>Pelech, Richardson and Caron</i> " .....	696
	Note: <i>Leman; Ritchie</i> .....	697
	<i>Hood v. Hood</i> .....	697
	<i>Masters v. Masters</i> .....	704
	<i>L.G. v. G.B.</i> .....	709
<b>XI. CHILD SUPPORT</b>		
A.	<u>Defining the Parent-Child Relationship</u>	
a)	<u>Establishing Paternity</u>	
	<i>Re Rhan and Pinsonneault</i> .....	716
	<i>K.P. v. P.N.</i> .....	719
	Note: Status of the Unmarried Father .....	720
b)	<u>In Loco Parentis</u>	
	<i>Primeau v. Primeau</i> .....	723
	<i>Ogden v. Anderson</i> .....	728
	<i>Carignan v. Carignan</i> .....	729
	<i>Hart v. Hart and Boyce</i> .....	737
	Note: <i>Morrison - Pelletier v. Pelletier</i> .....	739
B.	<u>Calculation of Child Support</u>	
a)	<u>Introduction</u>	
	Blown and Milliken, "The Failure of the Legal System to Protect the Legal Rights of Children" .....	740
	Department of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i> .....	745
	Eekelaar and Maclean, "The Evolution of Private Law Maintenance Obligations" .....	746

Eekelaar, "Maintenance and Children" from <i>Family Law and Social Policy</i> .....	747
 b) <u>The Paras Formula</u>	
Rogerson, "Judicial Interpretation of the Spousal and Child Support Provisions of the Divorce Act" .....	749
<i>Paras v. Paras</i> .....	750
Rogerson, "Judicial Interpretation of the Spousal and Child Support Provisions of the Divorce Act" .....	751
<i>Lucas v. Lucas</i> .....	755
<i>Moosa v. Moosa</i> .....	758
<i>Note: Contributions of the Custodial Parent Under the Paras Formula</i> .....	760
Further Reading .....	760
 c) <u>New Developments in Child Support: The Judicial Arena</u>	
<i>Levesque v. Levesque</i> .....	761
<i>Willick v. Willick</i> .....	772
<i>Note: Variation of Child Support Agreements</i> .....	787
<i>Kawall v. Kawall; Rusticus v. Rusticus</i> (Lawyer's Weekly) .....	788
 d) <u>Legislative Reform of Child Support Law: Child Support Guidelines</u>	
Pask, "The Effect of Maintenance on Custody Sharing" .....	791
<i>Note: The Development of Child Support Guidelines in Canada</i> .....	793
Federal/Provincial/Territorial Family Law Committee, <i>Report and Recommendations on Child Support</i> .....	793
 e) <u>Variation of Child Support and Second Family Obligations</u>	
Government of Canada, <i>The New Child Support Package,</i> (March 6, 1996) .....	795
Rogerson, "Judicial Interpretation of the Spousal and Child Support Provisions of the <i>Divorce Act, 1985</i> ".....	803
Eekelaar, Family Law and Social Policy .....	803
<i>Sawchyn v. Sawchyn</i> .....	804
<i>Storer v. Storer</i> .....	807
<i>R. (L.D.) v. R. (H.D.)</i> .....	809
<i>Note: Zablocki v. Redhail</i> .....	810
<i>Johnston v. Haywood</i> (Lawyer's Weekly).....	811

f) Child Support and Access

Note: <i>Twaddle v. Twaddle; Lee v. Lee; Brownell v. Brownell;</i> <i>Harrison v. Harrison .....</i>	817
<i>Welstead v. Bainbridge .....</i>	817

**X. CUSTODY AND ACCESS****A. Introduction**

Folberg, "Custody Overview" .....	819
Boyd, "Women, Men and Relationships with Children: Is Equality Possible?" .....	822
Gordon, "Multiple Meanings of Equality: A Case Study in Custody Litigation" .....	826
Richards, "Divorcing Children: Roles for Parents and the State" .....	834
<i>Young v. Young .....</i>	837

**B. The Best Interests Test****a) Applications**

Department of Justice, <i>Custody and Access: Public Discussion Paper</i> .....	856
Boyd, "Women, Men and Relationships with Children: Is Equality Possible?" .....	863
<i>Talsky v. Talsky.....</i>	864
<i>Klachefsky v. Brown .....</i>	869
<i>R. v. R.....</i>	875
<i>Fishback v. Fishback .....</i>	884
Boyd, "Women, Men and Relationships with Children: Is Equality Possible?" .....	889

**b) Violence and Abuse**

"Mother loses custody after move to shelter", <i>The Globe and Mail</i> , February 15, 1989 .....	891
<i>Young v. Young .....</i>	891
<i>Renaud v. Renaud .....</i>	896
Myers, "Allegations of Child Sexual Abuse in Custody and Visitation Litigation: Recommendations for Improved Fact Finding and Child Protection" .....	896

c) <u>Sexual Orientation</u>	
<i>Bezaire v. Bezaire</i> .....	900
Crean, <i>In the Name of the Fathers: The Story Behind Child Custody</i> .....	904
Ehrcke, "Limiting Judicial Discretion in Custody Proceedings on Divorce" .....	906
Note: <i>Saunders v. Saunders</i> .....	910
<i>K. (Re)</i> .....	910
C. <u>Alternatives to the Best Interests Test</u>	
Folberg, "Joint Custody".....	916
Note: Recent Changes to California's Custody Legislation .....	921
Department of Justice, <i>Custody and Access: Public Discussion Paper</i> .....	921
Lenoff, "Joint Custody and Beyond" .....	923
Department of Justice, <i>Custody and Access: Public Discussion Paper</i> .....	928
Boyd, "Potentialities and Perils of the Primary Caregiver Presumption".....	929
<i>K. v. K</i> .....	934
Department of Justice, <i>Custody and Access: Public Discussion Paper</i> .....	937
Boyd, "W(h)ither Feminism? The Department of Justice Public Discussion Paper on Custody and Access" .....	938
D. <u>Mobility Rights of the Custodial Parent and Access</u>	
<i>Gordon v. Goertz</i> .....	942
E. <u>Interference With Access</u>	
<i>Tremblay v. Tremblay</i> .....	959
<i>Frame v. Smith</i> .....	960

